September 18, 2013 No. 13-5

## Highlights

- 21 Commonwealth charter schools now operate in Boston and there will be 21 in SY15-16. 6,557 Boston resident students attend charter schools with 9,475 expected in SY15-16.
- A key policy choice for the next Mayor is how much to protect the BPS budget in light of the City's growing charter tuition assessment loss.
- The state per-pupil charter tuition reimbursement is only funded at $62 \%$ in FY14, a loss of $\$ 9.3 \mathrm{M}$ for Boston.

A special thank you to the Research Bureau's Cabinet Members for their generous support.

Arlington Advisory Partners Beacon Capital Partners Blue Cross Blue Shield of Massachusetts<br>BNY Mellon<br>Citizens Bank<br>Comcast<br>Fidelity Investments<br>John Hancock Financial<br>KPMG LLP<br>Liberty Mutual Insurance<br>McKinsey \& Co.<br>NSTAR<br>Partners HealthCare<br>P \& G Gillette<br>State Street Corporation<br>Suffolk Construction<br>Verizon

333 Washington Street, Suite 854
Boston, Massachusetts 02108

## Charter Seat Growth Should Drive BPS Reform

BPS focus on low-performing schools also requires legis/ative support

The Boston Public Schools' (BPS) initiatives to improve student achievement in its underperforming schools need to attain success for two key reasons. First, BPS school success will be a key factor in retaining students who might otherwise consider transferring to the expanding seats in Commonwealth charter schools expected over the next three years. Second, the equity of high performing schools in all neighborhoods of the City is a critical ingredient in the success of the new student assignment plan that will begin implementation in September 2014.

The number of Boston resident students attending Commonwealth charter schools is projected to reach 9,475 in three years, an increase of 2,918 students or $44.5 \%$. That increase will cause a further reduction of the City's operational revenues as Boston's net charter tuition assessment is estimated to grow to \$116 million in SY15-16, an increase of $\$ 49.3$ million or $73.6 \%$. Based on past experience, of the projected increase of 2,918 Boston resident students attending charter schools, at least 1,608 or $55 \%$ of these students will transfer from the BPS, potentially bringing the total empty school seats to over 5,000 by SY15-16.

Boston currently has 127 public schools, 96 of which were assigned a state performance Level in 2012. Of the 96 schools, 12 are Level 4 Turnaround schools ( $12.5 \%$ ) and 48 or $50 \%$ are Level 3 schools, which represent the lowest $20 \%$ in student performance statewide. Now enrolled in these 60 schools are 30,300 students who represent $53.4 \%$ of the total student enrollment. These are the schools that most need to improve student performance and BPS's efforts should be bolstered by state legislative support.

Turning around these low performing schools will require a comprehensive approach involving action steps by the BPS, Commonwealth and charter schools. The Research Bureau proposes the following three-point plan:

- Education reform legislation now being considered should focus on Level 3 and Level 4 schools in providing proven flexibilities for success. The cap on Horace Mann charter schools should be removed and their renewal facilitated. Boston is now at its Commonwealth charter school cap, which should be raised.
- The BPS should continue its focus on closing the achievement gap and complete its multi-year facilities plan to guide it in the most efficient utilization of its facilities and identify possible school closings as needed.
- Commonwealth charter schools have become a permanent part of the educational fabric of Boston and should be included in the portfolio of schools focused on improvement of Boston's low performing schools.


## History of Boston Charter Schools

Commonwealth charter schools first opened their doors in Boston in 1995, with four schools located in the City enrolling 785 students. Charter schools were first authorized by the Education Reform Act of 1993. Charter schools are funded on a per-pupil basis determined by enrollment cost factors such as grade level, education program, or poverty status, in addition to district spending beyond state requirements and the facilities spending rate. The per-pupil tuition assessment is partially reimbursed over the first six years a student attends a charter school, leaving Boston to fund the net impact. Local charter school tuition payments had been capped at $9 \%$ of a school district's net school spending requirement. For the past 19 years, Commonwealth charter schools served as a popular alternative to traditional BPS schools for Boston families to experience innovative learning environments and in doing so to create pressure for reform in the Boston Public School System.

Figure 1

Boston Charter Tuition as \% of Required Net School Spending, FY08-FY13


Source: MA Dept. of Secondarv and Elementarv Education

By 2010, demand for charter seats was so strong among Boston residents that the City's charter tuition payments were approaching the 9\% cap. Charter schools located in Boston were also concentrated in certain sections of the City and mostly catered to students in middle and high school grades. Demand for more charter seats, combined with the national education reform environment in January 2010, led to the passage of

The Achievement Gap Act (Ch.12, Acts of 2010). The Act, approved in response to the Federal Race to the Top competition, allows the state to grant more Commonwealth charter schools, up to $18 \%$ of net school spending, for school districts in the lowest $20 \%$ of statewide performance.

By SY2012-2013, 20 Commonwealth charter schools operated in Boston with an enrollment of 6,379 , of which 6,078 were Boston residents. (Appendix A) Also, nine charter schools in other cities and towns accepted 479 Boston students, bringing the total number of Boston resident students attending charter schools to 6,557 or $11.5 \%$ of the BPS enrollment.

The number of charter seats authorized for Boston residents as of 2013 was 10,005. On February 25, 2013, the Massachusetts Board of Education authorized 835 additional charter school seats over the next few years in accordance with Chapter 12, bringing the total number of approved seats for Boston from 10,005 to 10,840. For each school district, the Board votes to authorize seats to be filled or set aside to be filled and holds back $5 \%$ of the seats under the cap for an enrollment fluctuation buffer.

Boston's charter spending as a percent of net school spending is allowed to increase one percentage point per year until it reaches $18 \%$ in fiscal 2017. For the first year of Chapter 12 expansion, three charter schools opened in Boston for SY11-12, bringing charter tuition to $9.8 \%$ of net school spending. In SY12-13, three more charter schools opened in Boston, making Boston's charter tuition reach $11.4 \%$ of net school spending under a 14\% cap.

In 2013, Boston has effectively reached its charter seat cap through 2017. Boston's current maximum charter seat cap is now set at 11,132, based on a Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) net school spending and charter tuition projection analysis released in April 2013. In 2017 when charter tuition is limited to $18 \%$ of net school spending, the projected cap is 11,751 seats, a 619-seat difference. However, after factoring in the $5 \%$ buffer, projected to be 587 seats, only 32 seats will be available.

## Charter Expansion Enrollment Impact

In SY 12-13, the number of Boston resident students attending Commonwealth charter schools, both in Boston and in other towns, increased by 808 or $14.0 \%$ to 6,557 . Of those students, 770 or $95.3 \%$ attended charter schools located in Boston while the remaining 38 students or $4.7 \%$ attend charter schools in other municipalities.

Current seat expansion plans are leading to a sharp increase in Boston charter enrollment. Boston resident student charter school enrollment is expected to increase by 2,918 students or $44.5 \%$ in the three years between SY12-13 and SY15-16 due to expansion authorizations under Chapter 12. (Appendix B) This projection is based on the enrollment growth plans of each charter school, including those outside the city serving Boston resident students. Enrollment growth during the four years between SY08-09 and SY11-12 averaged $4.9 \%$ annually. However, the average annual enrollment growth rate projected in the four years from SY12-13 through SY15-16 will almost triple to 13.3\%. Most of the Commonwealth charter growth is seen in grades five and six due to new school openings and expansions.

## BPS Enrollment Impact

For most of the last fifteen years, the BPS has been challenged with declining enrollment, though it has retained, on average, enrollment of $75 \%$ of Boston resident students. Total BPS enrollment

Figure 2
Boston Resident Charter School Enrollment SY10-11 Through SY15-16


Source: MA. Dept. of Elementary and Secondary Education and City of Boston projections
has been on the rise over the past four years with a 538 or $1 \%$ increase in students. Enrollment in the BPS for SY12-13 was 56,905 as of midDecember 2012, a $0.67 \%$ increase over the prior school year. (Appendix C) The BPS budgeted enrollment for SY12-13 was 57,087 and in SY13-14, it is projected to rise to 58,271 , an increase of nearly 1,200 students, primarily in the early grades. Nearly half of these students have highseverity disabilities.

When factoring out pre-kindergarten and kindergarten enrollment for all education programs, BPS enrollment has dropped over four years. Enrollment remained flat between SYO8-09 and SY10-11, while in SY11-12 and SY12-13 enrollment dropped. The biggest BPS enrollment losses have occurred in the fifth grade. The number of BPS fifth graders fell by 459 or $12 \%$ between SY11-12 and SY12-13, coinciding with the opening of eight charter schools. BPS enrollment losses are also occurring at the high school level, where enrollment has dropped by 1,035 students or $5.6 \%$ over the past four school years. Between SY10-11 and SY11-12, BPS high school enrollment declined by 569 students or $3.2 \%$.

Figure 3


Source: Mass. Department of Elementary and Secondary Education

Of the BPS students who have entered Commonwealth charter schools since fiscal 2002, 81.1\% have transferred in the transitional years of fifth, sixth, and ninth grades. (Appendix D) Over the next three years, Boston residents in Boston charter schools will have the most seats added to sixth, seventh, and eighth grades, at a total of

1,206. K1 and K2 charter seats, currently at 616, will increase by 239 seats during this time.

Since fiscal 2002, 13,533 Boston children have enrolled in a Commonwealth charter school. Of this total, 7,452 or $55.1 \%$ had been enrolled in the BPS the previous year. An additional 5,409 or 40\% came from private schools or 'home', which includes children too young to have been in school in the previous year. However, when considering only first graders and older, $74 \%$ of charter school transfer students had been enrolled in a BPS school the previous year.

As more Commonwealth charter school seats have become available to Boston students, charter schools have drawn an increasing share of students from the BPS. In SY11-12, 57.8\% of Boston resident students enrolled in Commonwealth charter schools had transferred from the BPS. The comparable percentage in SYO1-02 was 54.1\%.

## Financial Impact

The rise in charter school enrollment among Boston students comes at a cost to the City of Boston. The financial impact is measured as the City's annual net charter assessment. The net charter tuition assessment is calculated by subtracting reimbursement aid provided to Boston by the Commonwealth in the first six years a student attends a charter school, from the tuition

Figure 4
Boston Net Charter Spending \& Enrollment SY11-12 to SY15-16


Source: MA Dept. of Elementary and Secondary Education and the City of Boston. *Figures are projected
assessment. (Appendix E) In fiscal 2014, the projected charter tuition assessment is $\$ 108.7$ million and the charter reimbursement is \$22.1 million for a net charter assessment of \$86.6 million. This assessment loss represents $41.3 \%$ of the City's total Chapter 70 school aid of \$209.4 million this year.

Over the past six years, net Chapter 70 aid as a percent of the BPS operating budget has decreased from $21.9 \%$ in fiscal 2008 to $13.1 \%$ in fiscal 2014 as a consequence of BPS's budget growth and the increase in the charter school tuition assessment loss during this time. (Appendix F)

Charter school expansion has an impact on three cost factors in Boston. The City incurs a cost when any Boston resident student enters a charter school in the following ways: 1) the net tuition assessment; 2) the excess capacity cost associated with the empty seat that is difficult to adjust for in a timely fashion; and 3) the transportation cost per pupil.

Charter Tuition - Due to the expected increase of Boston students attending charter schools, growth in Boston's net charter tuition payment is expected to climb to $\$ 116.3$ million in fiscal 2016, an increase of $\$ 49.3$ million or $73.6 \%$ over the three years from fiscal 2013. In comparison, the total increase in Boston's net impact over the prior three years from fiscal 2009 to fiscal 2012 was $\$ 16.1$ million or $35 \%$.

The City of Boston is assessed a tuition payment for the total number of students who live in the City and attend a charter school. The assessment represents a transfer of state school aid from Boston to the charter schools as the money follows the student. The charter per-pupil rate is intended to reflect district funding for BPS students based on three components: 1) the charter school foundation budget, which, in part, accounts for per -pupil spending including grade level, education program, (regular, English language instruction, or special education), and poverty status; 2) an amount representing BPS per-pupil spending beyond state requirements; and 3) a component reflecting a facilities spending rate.

Reimbursement Aid - For municipalities losing Chapter 70 funds due to students transferring to charter schools, the Commonwealth provides some financial mitigation through a six-year reimbursement schedule. Under Chapter 12, the annual incremental tuition assessment is reimbursed $100 \%$ in the first year and $25 \%$ of the tuition in each of the next five years. Boston's total reimbursement in fiscal 2009 was $\$ 15.4$ million and the state will allocate \$22.1 million in fiscal 2014. The reimbursement is subject to appropriation and from fiscal 2005 to fiscal 2012, the Commonwealth appropriated $100 \%$ of its obligation. However, in fiscal 2013, the state paid only $95.7 \%$ of its obligation. The fiscal 2014 adopted state budget covers only $62.2 \%$ of its reimbursement obligation, which, for Boston, represents a loss of $\$ 9.2$ million if it had been funded at 100\%.

City Covers Tuition Loss - The rapid growth of Boston's net charter school tuition assessment has reduced funding for City operations, but it has had minimal impact on the City's planned investment in the public schools. The City's operating revenues factor in the net tuition payment loss and for the past six years, the BPS budget has averaged $35 \%$ of the available revenues. During that same period, the net charter school tuition has increased from $\$ 45.9$ million in fiscal 2009 to $\$ 86.6$ million in fiscal 2014.

Empty Seat Cost - According to the BPS, as of fiscal 2013, there are 3,399 empty seats across the BPS. This figure represents total excess capacity throughout all BPS classrooms, determined by the gap between actual classroom enrollment and the maximum class size under the teachers' contract, without accounting for unused building space. The cost per empty seat, at $\$ 3,853$, is determined by the average BPS teacher salary, including benefits, divided by the average contractual maximum class size.

Charter school expansion between fiscal 2013 and 2016 should lead to an additional 2,918 Boston resident students attending charter schools. At least 1,608 or $55.1 \%$ of the students entering charter schools are expected to leave the BPS, adding to the 3,399 empty seats. This creates a
total of 5,007 empty seats between SY12-13 and SY15-16 in the continued absence of a comprehensive facilities plan and assuming no growth in total BPS enrollment. At $\$ 3,853$ each, the total cost of empty seats could potentially reach $\$ 19.3$ million by SY15-16, with $\$ 6.2$ million coming directly from the additional seats lost to charter schools.

Charter Transportation - The BPS is responsible for funding most transportation for charter school students in addition to BPS students. Currently 3,847 charter students ride BPS school buses. Approximately 1,310 Boston resident charter students are expected to enter charter schools from non-BPS schools between SY12-13 and SY1516 and ride school buses. The fiscal 2013 per-pupil cost to transport BPS regular education students is $\$ 1,343$. It is conservative to also use this number as the cost to transport charter students because of route and resource planning. Therefore, the cost for transporting additional charter students between SY12-13 and SY15-16 may be as high as $\$ 1.8$ million.

At present, route lengths for BPS and charter school buses are similar, which makes for comparable per-pupil transportation costs. However, BPS believes that as student assignment zones shrink with the new student assignment plan in September 2014, BPS bus routes will shorten, making the per-pupil cost for BPS students comparatively lower. Also, BPS controls its school start times, allowing for logistical efficiencies, while charter schools schedule their own start times, which can complicate route planning and efficiency.

## Conclusion and Recommendations

Commonwealth charter schools have become a permanent part of the educational fabric of Boston. This situation requires the Boston Public Schools to develop a collaborative working plan with the charter schools while focusing on improving achievement in its own schools to be more successful.

The fact that enrollment in Commonwealth charter schools in Boston is expected to increase by an annual average of $13.3 \%$ over the next four years, indicates the continual interest of parents and students for quality alternatives to the Boston public schools. The fact that the net tuition assessment Boston will lose to charter schools is estimated to reach $\$ 116$ million in SY 15-16 explains why BPS schools must become more successful in providing quality education to retain its students.

Whether the next Administration will be able or willing to mitigate the charter tuition loss in its support of the School Department budget in future years as has been done in past years is a key policy choice the next Mayor will have to evaluate in preparing the City's fiscal 2015 budget.

Recognizing the important role charter schools will continue to play in Boston and the BPS's need to improve its schools' educational quality, the Research Bureau proposes the following recommendations starting with a three-point plan:

## Recommendation I: A Three Point Plan:

1. Legislative Education Reform - Educational reform legislation to improve student achievement in underperforming schools should be enacted this year. The law should extend Turnaround plan flexibilities for existing Level 4 schools in Boston. For Level 3 schools, it should extend the same Level 4 flexibilities in areas of selecting their educational team, budgeting, and scheduling. It should also facilitate opportunities to convert underperforming Level 3 schools into Horace Mann in-district charter schools, which have the same flexibilities as charter schools, but Chapter 70 tuition funds stay in the district. For Horace Mann schools, the new law should facilitate openings and renewals in addition to removing the cap on these schools. Parents and students should be given more options by expanding the cap on Commonwealth charter schools in Level 4 Districts to keep pressure on the BPS to improve student achievement in its underperforming schools. Including provisions to authorize a more collaborative relationship between charter schools and district schools is also important.
2. BPS Reform and Facilities Plan - The BPS should continue its focus on closing the achievement gap in low performing schools with additional support, resources, and what flexibility it can offer these schools. The Department should complete its multi-year comprehensive facilities plan which should serve as a true strategic facilities plan that can guide the BPS in the most efficient utilization of its existing facilities with any new schools and also identify possible school closings as needed.
3. School Portfolio Plan - Agreements between the BPS and Commonwealth charter school operators should be authorized to enable charter school management to operate in chronically underperforming schools to serve the same students and bring high performing schools to more Boston neighborhoods.

## Recommendation II:

Full Funding of Tuition Reimbursement - The state's six-year reimbursement schedule to help mitigate the loss of charter tuition funds should be fully funded each year. The reimbursement schedule acknowledges that savings from students transferring to charter schools take some time to achieve. From fiscal 2005 to fiscal 2012, the Commonwealth appropriated 100\% of its obligation. However, in fiscal 2013, the state paid only $95.7 \%$ of its obligation and the fiscal 2014 adopted state budget covers only 62.2\%. The reimbursement at $62.2 \%$ represents a loss to Boston of $\$ 9.3$ million from what would have been received if the account had been fully funded. Restoring the reimbursement to full funding statewide in fiscal 2014 would require an additional $\$ 28.3$ million.

## Appendix A

## Charter Schools Attended by Students Living in Boston

SY12-13

## Commonwealth Charter Schools in Boston

| Charter School | Location |  | SY 12-13 Enrollment |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Grade Level | Total Students Enrolled (FTE) | Boston Students Enrolled (FTE) | \% Boston Students |
| Academy Of the Pacific Rim Charter Public | Boston- Hyde Park | 5-12 | 502 | 478 | 95.2\% |
| Boston Collegiate Charter | Boston- Dorchester | 5-12 | 607 | 598 | 98.5\% |
| Boston Preparatory Charter Public | Boston- Hyde Park | 6-12 | 364 | 364 | 100.0\% |
| Boston Renaissance Charter Public | Boston- Central | K-6 | 944 | 886 | 93.9\% |
| Bridge Boston Charter School | Boston | PK-K | 107 | 104 | 97.2\% |
| City On A Hill Charter Public | Boston- Roxbury | 9-12 | 282 | 278 | 98.6\% |
| Codman Academy Charter Public | Boston- Dorchester | 9-12 | 147 | 145 | 98.6\% |
| Conservatory Lab Charter | Boston- Brighton | PK-6 | 178 | 175 | 98.3\% |
| Dorchester Collegiate Academy Charter School | Boston- Dorchester | 4-6 | 135 | 134 | 99.3\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter | Boston- Roslindale | K-8 | 485 | 458 | 94.4\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter 2 | Boston | K-5 | 265 | 262 | 98.8\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter 3 | Boston | K-5 | 178 | 143 | 80.3\% |
| Excel Academy Charter | Boston- East Boston | 5-8 | 215 | 133 | 61.9\% |
| Excel Academy Charter 2 | Boston | 5-8 | 56 | 55 | 98.2\% |
| KIPP Academy Boston Charter School | Boston | 5 | 72 | 71 | 98.6\% |
| MATCH Charter Public High | Boston- Allston | 6-12 | 480 | 460 | 95.8\% |
| MATCH Community Day Charter Public School | Boston | PK-2 | 200 | 200 | 100.0\% |
| Neighborhood House Charter | Boston- Dorchester | PK-8 | 399 | 382 | 95.7\% |
| Roxbury Preparatory Charter | Boston- Roxbury | 6-8 | 545 | 541 | 99.3\% |
| Smith Leadership Academy Charter Public | Boston- Dorchester | 6-8 | 217 | 211 | 97.2\% |
| Subtotal (20) |  |  | 6,379 | 6,078 | 95.3\% |

## Appendix A (continued)

## Non-Boston Commonwealth Charter Schools Accepting Boston Students

| Charter School | Location |  | SY 12-13 Enrollment |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Grade Level | Total Students Enrolled (FTE) | Boston Students Enrolled (FTE) | \% Boston Students |
| Abby Kelley Foster Charter Public | Worcester | K-12 | 1,423 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Advanced Math and Science Academy Charter | Marlborough | 5-10 | 968 | 1 | 0.1\% |
| Atlantis Charter School | Fall River | K-8 | 758 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Benjamin Banneker Charter Public | Cambridge | K-6 | 352 | 151 | 42.9\% |
| Christa McAuliffe Regional Charter Public | Framingham | 6-8 | 308 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Community Charter School of Cambridge | Cambridge | 7-12 | 373 | 194 | 52.0\% |
| Excel Academy Charter- Chelsea | Chelsea | 5-5 | 112 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Foxborough Regional Charter | Foxborough | K-12 | 1,214 | 5 | 0.4\% |
| Hillview Montessori Charter Public School | Haverhill | K-8 | 303 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Kipp Academy Lynn Charter | Lynn | 5-9 | 585 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Mystic Valley Regional Charter | Malden | K-12 | 1,488 | 4 | 0.3\% |
| Phoenix Charter Academy | Chelsea | 9-12 | 183 | 43 | 23.5\% |
| Pioneer Charter School of Science | Everett | 7-12 | 356 | 15 | 4.2\% |
| Prospect Hill Academy Charter | Somerville/ Cambridge | PK-12 | 1,138 | 64 | 5.6\% |
| Salem Academy Charter School | Salem | 6-12 | 338 | 2 | 0.6\% |
| South Shore Charter Public | Norwell | K-12 | 540 | 0 | 0.0\% |
| Subtotal (16) |  |  | 10,439 | 479 | 4.6\% |
| Grand Total (34) |  |  |  | 6,557 |  |


| Impact on Boston |  |
| :--- | :---: |
| Total Boston Students Enrolled | 6,557 |
| Total FY13 Tuition Payment | $\$ 89,565,576$ |
| Total FY13 Tuition Reimbursement | $\$ 22,581,628$ |
| Net FY13 Impact | $\$ 66,983,948$ |

Source: Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, Charter School Enrollment Reports.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

## Appendix B

## Projected Enrollment for Charters Serving Boston Students <br> SY12-13 to SY15-16

## Charter Schools In Boston

|  | SY12-13 | SY13-14 (1) | SY14-15 (1) | SY15-16 (1) | Variance SY12-13 -SY15-16 | \% |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Academy of the Pacific Rim Charter School | 478 | 507 | 539 | 543 | 65 | 13\% |
| Boston Collegiate Charter School | 598 | 646 | 665 | 665 | 67 | 11\% |
| Boston Preparatory Charter Public School | 364 | 372 | 385 | 400 | 36 | 10\% |
| Boston Renaissance Charter School | 886 | 881 | 944 | 944 | 58 | 7\% |
| Bridge Boston Charter School | 104 | 141 | 180 | 216 | 112 | 108\% |
| City on a Hill Charter Public School | 278 | 277 | 280 | 280 | 2 | 1\% |
| City on a Hill II Charter Public School | - | 110 | 140 | 210 | 210 | - |
| Codman Academy Charter Public School | 145 | 210 | 265 | 305 | 160 | 110\% |
| Conservatory Lab Charter School | 175 | 309 | 396 | 420 | 245 | 140\% |
| Dorchester Collegiate Academy Charter School | 134 | 200 | 190 | 200 | 66 | 50\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter School 1 | 458 | 488 | 510 | 510 | 52 | 11\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter School 2 | 262 | 359 | 510 | 510 | 248 | 95\% |
| Edward Brooke Charter School 3 | 143 | 233 | 257 | 340 | 197 | 137\% |
| Excel Academy - East Boston | 133 | 135 | 148 | 185 | 52 | 39\% |
| Excel Academy - Orient Heights | 55 | 112 | 168 | 224 | 169 | 308\% |
| KIPP Boston | 71 | 143 | 288 | 403 | 332 | 467\% |
| MATCH Charter Public School | 460 | 477 | 550 | 550 | 90 | 19\% |
| MATCH Community Day Charter School | 199 | 300 | 350 | 400 | 201 | 101\% |
| Neighborhood House Charter School | 382 | 385 | 400 | 400 | 18 | 5\% |
| Roxbury Preparatory Charter School | 541 | 715 | 805 | 1,125 | 584 | 108\% |
| Smith Leadership Academy Public Charter School | 211 | 216 | 216 | 216 | 5 | 2\% |
| Subtotal | 6,078 | 7,216 | 8,186 | 9,046 | 2,968 | 49\% |

## Appendix B (continued)

## Charter Schools Outside of Boston Serving Boston Students

|  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |

(1) These figures are projections based on Charter School expansion plans approved by the State.
(2) There is no projection for schools outside of Boston serving Boston students, as such, the City of Boston uses the 2013/2014 projection to predict these enrollments

Source: Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education and City of Boston.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

## Appendix C

## Boston Public Schools Enrollment by Grade SY08-SY12*

| Kindergarten | SY08-09 | SY09-10 | SY10-11 | SY11-12 | SY12-13 | Change 2011-2012 | \% Change 2011-2012 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Change } \\ & \text { 2008-2012 } \end{aligned}$ | \% Change 2008-2012 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Pre-Kindergarten | 384 | 366 | 374 | 427 | 485 | 58 | 13.6\% | 101 | 26.3\% |
| Kindergarten 1 | 2,061 | 2,117 | 2,163 | 2,212 | 2,397 | 185 | 8.4\% | 336 | 16.3\% |
| Kindergarten 2 | 3,948 | 4,055 | 4,218 | 4,216 | 4,471 | 255 | 6.0\% | 523 | 13.2\% |
| Total Kindergarten | 6,393 | 6,538 | 6,755 | 6,855 | 7,353 | 498 | 7.3\% | 960 | 15.0\% |


| Elementary |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Grade 1 | 4,145 | 4,288 | 4,365 | 4,368 | 4,595 | 227 | $5.2 \%$ | 450 | $10.9 \%$ |
| Grade 2 | 4,116 | 4,015 | 4,195 | 4,246 | 4,180 | $(66)$ | $-1.6 \%$ | 64 | $1.6 \%$ |
| Grade 3 | 4,053 | 4,062 | 3,972 | 4,146 | 4,202 | 56 | $1.4 \%$ | 149 | $3.7 \%$ |
| Grade 4 | 4,029 | 4,002 | 4,104 | 3,974 | 4,106 | 132 | $3.3 \%$ | 77 | $1.9 \%$ |
| Grade 5 | 3,875 | 3,864 | 3,796 | 3,841 | 3,382 | $(459)$ | $-12.0 \%$ | $(493)$ | $-\mathbf{- 1 2 . 7 \%}$ |
| Total Elementary | $\mathbf{2 0 , 2 1 8}$ | $\mathbf{2 0 , 2 3 1}$ | $\mathbf{2 0 , 4 3 2}$ | $\mathbf{2 0 , 5 7 5}$ | $\mathbf{2 0 , 4 6 5}$ | $\mathbf{( 1 1 0 )}$ | $\mathbf{- 0 . 5 \%}$ | $\mathbf{2 4 7}$ | $\mathbf{1 . 2 \%}$ |

Middle Schools

| Grade 6 | 3,354 | 3,687 | 3,721 | 3,605 | 3,657 | 52 | $1.4 \%$ | 303 | $9.0 \%$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Grade 7 | 3,940 | 3,780 | 3,987 | 4,042 | 3,971 | $(71)$ | $-1.8 \%$ | 31 | $0.8 \%$ |
| Grade 8 | 4,046 | 3,972 | 3,800 | 3,964 | 4,078 | 114 | $\mathbf{2 . 9 \%}$ | 32 | $0.8 \%$ |
| Total Middle Schools | $\mathbf{1 1 , 3 4 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 1 , 4 3 9}$ | $\mathbf{1 1 , 5 0 8}$ | $\mathbf{1 1 , 6 1 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 1 , 7 0 6}$ | $\mathbf{9 5}$ |  | $\mathbf{0 . 8 \%}$ | $\mathbf{3 6 6}$ |


| Grade 9 | 5,250 | 5,044 | 4,920 | 4,660 | 4,783 | 123 | 2.6\% | (467) | -8.9\% |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 10 | 4,491 | 4,499 | 4,358 | 4,206 | 4,041 | (165) | -3.9\% | (450) | -10.0\% |
| Grade 11 | 4,233 | 4,298 | 4,263 | 4,253 | 4,202 | (51) | -1.2\% | (31) | -0.7\% |
| Grade 12 | 4,442 | 4,468 | 4,512 | 4,365 | 4,355 | (10) | -0.2\% | (87) | -2.0\% |
| Total High Schools | 18,416 | 18,309 | 18,053 | 17,484 | 17,381 | (103) | -0.6\% | $(1,035)$ | -5.6\% |
| Total BPS | 56,367 | 56,517 | 56,748 | 56,525 | 56,905 | 380 | 0.7\% | 538 | 1.0\% |
| \% Increase |  | 0.27\% | 0.41\% | -0.39\% | 0.67\% |  |  |  |  |

* As of December of each year

Source: BPS, Analysis of Students by Zone, Actual Enrollment and BPS Analysis of Students by Program, Mid-December Enrollment.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

## Appendix D

## Transfers to Charter Schools

## ALL Students Transferring Into Charter Schools SY01-02-SY11-12 by Source

| Grade |  <br> Home | Out of Town | BPS | Total |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| K1 | 501 |  |  | 501 |
| K2 | 2,927 | 21 | 33 | 2,981 |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | 433 | 10 | 43 | 486 |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | 38 | 23 | 224 | 285 |
| $\mathbf{3}$ | 40 | 19 | 149 | 208 |
| $\mathbf{4}$ | 64 | 14 | 258 | 336 |
| $\mathbf{5}$ | 564 | 128 | 1,622 | 2,314 |
| $\mathbf{6}$ | 345 | 180 | 2,918 | 3,443 |
| $\mathbf{7}$ | 175 | 76 | 458 | 709 |
| $\mathbf{8}$ | 67 | 50 | 194 | 311 |
| $\mathbf{9}$ | 247 | 118 | 1,503 | 1,868 |
| $\mathbf{1 0}$ | 5 | 24 | 38 | 67 |
| $\mathbf{1 1}$ | 2 | 6 | 11 | 19 |
| $\mathbf{1 2}$ | 1 | 3 | 1 | 5 |
| Total | $\mathbf{5 , 4 0 9}$ | $\mathbf{6 7 2}$ | $\mathbf{7 , 4 5 2}$ | $\mathbf{1 3 , 5 3 3}$ |
| $\%$ | $40.0 \%$ | $5.0 \%$ | $55.1 \%$ | $100.0 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |

BPS Students Only Transferring Into Charter Schools SY01-02-SY11-12 by Grade

| Grade | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY01- } \\ & \text { SY02 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY02- } \\ & \text { SY03 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY03- } \\ & \text { SY04 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY04- } \\ & \text { SY05 } \end{aligned}$ | SY05SY06 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY06- } \\ & \text { SY07 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY07- } \\ & \text { SY08 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY08- } \\ & \text { SY09 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY09- } \\ & \text { SY10 } \end{aligned}$ | SY10SY11 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SY11- } \\ & \text { SY12 } \end{aligned}$ | Total | \% |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| K2 | 11 | 12 |  | 1 |  | 5 |  | 1 | 1 | 2 |  | 33 | 0.4\% |
| 1 | 17 | 8 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 7 | 1 |  | 3 | 1 | 1 | 43 | 0.6\% |
| 2 | 17 | 24 | 12 | 21 | 37 | 32 | 14 | 4 | 4 | 7 | 52 | 224 | 3.0\% |
| 3 | 15 | 21 | 22 | 21 | 15 | 25 | 9 | 8 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 149 | 2.0\% |
| 4 | 20 | 16 | 24 | 26 | 20 | 39 | 2 | 6 | 41 | 33 | 31 | 258 | 3.5\% |
| 5 | 49 | 175 | 147 | 153 | 117 | 83 | 174 | 155 | 166 | 145 | 258 | 1,622 | 21.8\% |
| 6 | 146 | 171 | 317 | 388 | 256 | 287 | 301 | 286 | 262 | 244 | 260 | 2,918 | 39.2\% |
| 7 | 40 | 31 | 37 | 37 | 27 | 49 | 44 | 43 | 44 | 45 | 61 | 458 | 6.1\% |
| 8 | 9 | 20 | 20 | 8 | 14 | 9 | 18 | 26 | 8 | 32 | 30 | 194 | 2.6\% |
| 9 | 112 | 114 | 155 | 203 | 142 | 120 | 126 | 128 | 138 | 146 | 119 | 1,503 | 20.2\% |
| 10 | 3 |  | 1 | 13 | 7 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 2 |  | 38 | 0.5\% |
| 11 |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  | 1 | 1 |  | 5 | 2 | 11 | 0.1\% |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | 0.0\% |
| Total | 439 | 592 | 739 | 872 | 637 | 660 | 691 | 662 | 674 | 666 | 820 | 7,452 | 100.0\% |

Source: Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

## Appendix E

Historical Enrollment of District Charter Schools
SY95-SY13

| School Year | Charter <br> Enrollment <br> (FTE) | Tuition <br> Assessment | Reimbursement | Net Impact to <br> Boston |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $95-96$ | 784 | $\$ 5,801,808$ | $\$ 5,256,000$ | $\$ 545,808$ |  |
| $96-97$ | 1,315 | $10,384,359$ | $3,081,800$ | $7,302,559$ |  |
| $97-98$ | 1,509 | $11,228,344$ | $2,026,200$ | $9,202,144$ |  |
| $98-99$ | 1,765 | $13,421,568$ | $2,193,224$ | $11,228,344$ |  |
| $99-00$ | 2,083 | $17,322,561$ | $5,242,570$ | $12,079,991$ |  |
| $00-01$ | 2,551 | $21,892,408$ | $7,787,732$ | $14,104,676$ |  |
| $01-02$ | 2,889 | $26,543,817$ | $7,970,814$ | $18,573,003$ |  |
| $02-03$ | 3,365 | $32,167,518$ | 60,323 | $32,107,195$ |  |
| $03-04$ | 3,967 | $36,503,900$ | $2,927,537$ | $33,576,363$ |  |
| $04-05$ | 4,434 | $41,875,268$ | $10,224,584$ | $31,650,684$ |  |
| $05-06$ | 4,182 | $43,922,686$ | $8,270,938$ | $35,651,748$ |  |
| $06-07$ | 4,509 | $48,375,443$ | $9,713,428$ | $38,662,015$ |  |
| $07-08$ | 4,763 | $55,466,364$ | $13,887,683$ | $41,578,681$ |  |
| $08-09$ | 4,962 | $61,257,924$ | $15,359,109$ | $45,898,815$ |  |
| $09-10$ | 5,086 | $62,020,257$ | $10,987,738$ | $51,032,519$ |  |
| $10-11$ | 5,273 | $68,292,834$ | $13,236,601$ | $55,056,233$ |  |
| $11-12$ | 5,749 | $74,085,738$ | $12,130,766$ | $61,954,972$ |  |
| $12-13$ * | 6,557 | $89,565,576$ | $22,581,628$ | $66,983,948$ |  |
| $13-14$ * | 7,645 | $108,661,809$ | $22,090,688$ | $86,571,121$ |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |

* SY12-13 and SY13-14 are preliminary and subject to change

Source: Massachusetts Department of Elementary \& Secondary Education and City of Boston.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

## Appendix F

## Chapter 70 School Aid <br> FY08-FY14 <br> Figures in 000's

|  | Actual <br> FY08 | Actual <br> FY09 | Actual <br> FY10 | Actual <br> FY11 | Actual <br> FY12 | Budget <br> FY13 | Budget <br> FY14 | Variance <br> FY08-14 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\%$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

(1) FY13 and FY14 Charter Tuition Assessments and Reimbursement reflect revised amounts from the Commonwealth as of July 2013.
(2) FY09 Chapter 70 and BPS Operating Budget includes $\$ 23.3$ million in ARRA funds that were used for general fund school purposes. The City accounts for these ARRA funds as Special Revenue.
(3) Net Chapter 70 represents the disposable state school aid revenue available to Boston
(4) BPS Operating Budget includes Health

Source: City of Boston Financial Statements and Budget and the Massachusetts Department of Elementary \& Secondary Education.
Prepared by: Boston Municipal Research Bureau

